

Pennsylvania Bar Association Judicial Review

RATINGS' DEFINITIONS

Highly Recommended: The candidate possesses the highest combination of legal ability, experience, integrity and temperament and would be capable of outstanding performance as a judge or justice of the court for which he/she is a candidate.

Recommended: Based on legal ability, experience, integrity and temperament, the candidate would be able to perform satisfactorily as a judge or justice of the court for which he/she is a candidate.

SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA (Pick one)

Honorable Cheryl L. Allen

<http://www.judgecherylallen.org/>

Rating: Highly Recommended

The Candidate served with distinction as a judge on the Common Pleas Court of Allegheny County from 1990 until 2007 when she was elected to the Superior Court. She is held in high esteem by her colleagues on the bench as well as by those who appear before her. She has extensive experience and particular expertise in the area of juvenile law. She implemented numerous innovative programs to address the needs of children, with emphasis on the importance of education and mentoring programs. The Candidate is known for her scholarly and thoughtful opinions, intellect, work ethic and passionate commitment to furthering justice. She has demonstrated fairness and compassion in all aspects of her professional career and service to her community. She has a keen, analytical mind, and she enjoys a well-earned reputation as a productive, principled and dedicated jurist. She has been recognized with several awards from the community. Lawyers have found her to be prepared and conscientious in her decision making. She has the breadth of experience and knowledge of the Rule of Law to serve with distinction on the highest court. She is highly recommended for this position.

Hon. Joan Orié Melvin

<http://www.judgeoriemelvin.com/index.cfm>

Rating: Highly Recommended

Endorsed by: PAGOP State Committee

The Candidate was elected to the Superior Court in 1997 and was retained by the voters for a second term in 2007. She previously served seven years as a judge on the Allegheny County Court of Common Pleas and five years as chief magistrate of the Pittsburgh Municipal Court, where she is credited for establishing the first Domestic Violence Court in Pennsylvania. She also worked for two years on a corporate legal staff and two years in private practice in Pittsburgh. Her diligence, organizational skills and strong work ethic have served her well in handling the heavy caseload of the Superior Court. Her written opinions are cogent and well reasoned. The Candidate has an impressive record of involvement in professional activities and community service, including her recent development of a program for high school students about the legal consequences of Internet usage. She is recognized as genial and fair minded, and she has demonstrated sound judicial temperament. She is respected by her colleagues on the Superior Court, the lawyers who have appeared before her and those who have worked with her in the community. Based on her solid record of performance, the Commission concludes that the Candidate is deserving of its highest rating.

Hon. Paul Panepinto

<http://www.judgepanepinto.com/>

Rating: Highly Recommended

Innovation in the administration of justice has been a hallmark of the Candidate's judicial career. A member of the Court of Common Pleas of Philadelphia since 1990, he is held in high regard by both lawyers practicing before him and his colleagues on the bench. As administrative judge of the Family Court in Philadelphia, he developed a truancy program that has become a national model. In addition to his solid record of court administration, the Candidate demonstrates expertise in handling complex litigation matters. He is a good communicator, and he demonstrates solid consensus-building skills. Hardworking, evenhanded, thoughtful and enthusiastic about the law, the Candidate's knowledge of established principles of the law is self evident. The Commission highly recommends the Candidate for a seat on the Supreme Court.

SUPERIOR COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA (Pick three)

Sallie Updyke Mundy

Rating: Recommended

Endorsed by: PAGOP State Committee

The Candidate has had diverse legal experience in her twenty-one year legal career. She has handled a variety of civil litigation matters, including medical malpractice defense cases and plaintiff personal injury cases. Recently, the Candidate has served as a voluntary assistant public defender in Tioga County. She has served as a member and then chair of a hearing committee of the Disciplinary Board of the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania. The Candidate is

bright and articulate and is regarded by her peers as personable, hardworking and compassion. She is dedicated to the improvement of the quality of justice and her writings are clear and concise. The Commission recommends her for a position on the Superior Court. (Commission member Riley recused himself from participation in the evaluation and rating of this Candidate.)

Hon. Judith F. Olson

Rating: Highly Recommended

Endorsed by: PAGOP State Committee

The Candidate excelled academically in both college and law school. She was a skilled and successful litigator, with broad experience in both the trial and appellate courts. In October 2008, she was appointed to the Allegheny County Court of Common Pleas. She is regarded by her peers as intelligent, ethical, congenial and fair and has a wellrounded reputation for diligence and productivity. Her character and integrity are beyond reproach, and she brings extensive community service. The Commission highly recommends her for a seat on the Superior Court.

Templeton Smith Jr.

Rating: Recommended

Endorsed by: PAGOP State Committee

The Candidate has extensive experience as an appellate advocate and has appeared before the Superior Court on numerous occasions. His substantive legal experience covers a wide variety of areas, including zoning, land use, commercial, medical malpractice and tort litigation. The Candidate is recognized for his strong writing abilities, scholarly legal analysis and effective advocacy. He has taught continuing legal education courses and has participated in bar association committees. In addition, he has provided pro bono support for church and community organizations. The Candidate has the requisite legal experience, intellectual ability, character and integrity to render him competent to fulfill the demanding responsibilities of a Superior Court judge and, therefore, the Commission recommends him for a position on the court.

COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA (Pick two)

Kevin Brobson

Rating: Recommended

Endorsed by: PAGOP State Committee

Since completing his federal judicial clerkship, the Candidate has concentrated his practice in the areas of administrative law and insurance law, both of which fall within the jurisdiction of the Commonwealth Court. His writings are analytical, logical, clear, cogent and easily read. Even though he is involved in a busy, complex practice, the Candidate has found time for civic duties and community service. He has demonstrated the legal ability sufficient to have earned the respect of lawyers and members of the bench. The Candidate possesses the requisite knowledge of the rules of evidence and courtroom procedures. He has the appropriate judicial temperament. Based on his credentials, experience, and writing ability, the Candidate is recommended to serve on the Commonwealth Court.

Honorable Alfonso Frioni Jr.

Rating: Recommended

Endorsed by: PAGOP State Committee

The Candidate has served as one of 15 administrative appeals judges/commissioners on the State Workers' Compensation Appeals Board since 1996. The board has statewide jurisdiction and the Candidate travels extensively to handle the large caseload. Although his legal expertise is narrowly focused in the area of workers' compensation, he is committed to maintaining the legitimacy and competency of the Appeals Board and seeks to inspire confidence in all those appearing before it. The Candidate has demonstrated competence and integrity in his professional and personal life and has a dedicated record of community service. The Commission believes the Candidate would be able to perform satisfactorily as a judge on the Commonwealth Court.

Hon. Patricia A. McCullough

Rating: Recommended

The Candidate worked for eight years as assistant general counsel for the University of Pittsburgh. She also has practiced law as a solo practitioner in Pittsburgh. She has served on the Allegheny County Board of Property Assessment Appeals and Review. The Candidate was appointed as a judge of the Court of Common Pleas of Allegheny County and served for nine months as a Family Law Court judge. She also served as executive director of Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Pittsburgh for a year. The Candidate has an impressive record of community service and is regarded as bright and committed to her work. Although the Candidate's trial court and appellate experience is somewhat limited, the Commission concludes that she would be able to perform satisfactorily as a judge of the Commonwealth Court.